Putative finite-volume effects for spatially-nonlocal operators

Chris Monahan Institute for Nuclear Theory University of Washington

with Raul Briceno, Juan Guerrero and Max Hansen

To appear real soon...

Nonlocal operators and nucleon structure

Wilson-line operators

- Quasi PDFs
- Pseudo PDFs

Currents

- Light quarks
- Auxiliary scalars
- Auxiliary heavy quarks

Smeared local operators

Nonlocal operators and nucleon structure

Wilson-line operators

- Quasi PDFs
- Pseudo PDFs

Currents

- Light quarks
- Auxiliary scalars
- Auxiliary heavy quarks

Smeared local operators



Finite-volume effects



 $e^{-m_{\pi}L}$



 $e^{-m_{\pi}|L-\xi|}$??? $e^{-m_{\pi}\xi}$???



Local operators

Finite-volume effects - infrared degrees of freedom

- pions and nucleons
- chiral perturbation theory

Consider pion tadpole correction to nucleon mass

• infinite volume $I_{\infty} = \int \frac{\mathrm{d}^4 k}{(2\pi)^4} \frac{1}{k^2 + m_{\pi}^2}$

• finite volume
$$I_{\rm FV} = \frac{1}{L^3} \sum_{\bf k} \int \frac{{\rm d}k_4}{2\pi} \frac{1}{k^2 + m_\pi^2}$$

• finite-volume effects
$$\delta I = I_{\infty} - I_{\rm FV} = \sum_{\mathbf{n}\neq 0} \int \frac{\mathrm{d}^4 k}{(2\pi)^4} \frac{e^{i\mathbf{n}\cdot\mathbf{k}L}}{k^2 + m_{\pi}^2}$$

$$\delta I = \frac{1}{(4\pi)^2} \sum_{\mathbf{n}} \left(\frac{4m_{\pi}}{|\mathbf{n}|L} \right) K_1(|\mathbf{n}|L) \sim e^{-m_{\pi}L}$$
M. Lüs

M. Lüscher, 1983





Local operators: pion mass



Also S. Beane et al., PRD 85 (2011) 034505

Our model

Couple two scalar particles $m_{\varphi} \ll m_{\chi}$:

- $\bullet \ \varphi$ plays the role of the pion
- χ plays the role of the nucleon

Introduce external current



Consider

$$\mathcal{M}_{\infty}(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{p}) \equiv \langle \mathbf{p} | \mathcal{J}(0, \boldsymbol{\xi}) \mathcal{J}(0) | \mathbf{p} \rangle$$

$$\delta \mathcal{M}_L(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{p}) \equiv \mathcal{M}_L(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{p}) - \mathcal{M}_\infty(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{p})$$

Leading order

R. Briceno, M Hansen & CJM, PRD 96 (2017) 014502

Finite-volume scaling

$$\delta \mathcal{M}_L(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{0}) \propto \frac{e^{-m_{\varphi}(L-\xi)}}{(L-\xi)^{3/2}}$$

A. Cherman et al, PRD 95 (2017) 074512









Leading order
$$\delta \mathcal{M}_L(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{0}) \propto \frac{e^{-m_{\chi}(L-\xi)}}{(L-\xi)^{3/2}} \ll e^{-m_{\varphi}L}$$

One loop



Dominant diagram



$$\delta \mathcal{M}_{L}^{(a)}(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{0}) \sim \frac{g^{2} g_{\varphi}^{2}}{128\pi^{3} m_{\varphi}} \left[\frac{\xi^{1/2}}{(L-\xi)^{3/2}} H_{x,3/2}(\xi) + \frac{(L-\xi)^{1/2}}{\xi^{3/2}} H_{x,3/2}(L-\xi) \right] e^{-m_{\varphi}L}$$
$$H_{f(x),\alpha}(\xi) = \int_{0}^{1} \mathrm{d}x f(x) \, \frac{m_{\varphi}^{\alpha}}{M(x)^{\alpha}} e^{-\xi(M(x)-m_{\varphi})}$$

Finite-volume scaling

$$\delta \mathcal{M}_L(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{0}) \propto \frac{\xi^{1/2}}{(L-\xi)^{3/2}} e^{-m_{\varphi}L}$$



Dominant diagram



$$\delta \mathcal{M}_{L}^{(a)}(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{0}) \sim \frac{g^{2} g_{\varphi}^{2}}{128\pi^{3} m_{\varphi}} \left[\frac{\xi^{1/2}}{(L-\xi)^{3/2}} H_{x,3/2}(\xi) + \frac{(L-\xi)^{1/2}}{\xi^{3/2}} H_{x,3/2}(L-\xi) \right] e^{-m_{\varphi}L}$$
$$H_{f(x),\alpha}(\xi) = \int_{0}^{1} \mathrm{d}x f(x) \, \frac{m_{\varphi}^{\alpha}}{M(x)^{\alpha}} e^{-\xi(M(x)-m_{\varphi})}$$

Finite-volume scaling

$$\delta \mathcal{M}_L(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{0}) \propto \frac{\xi^{1/2}}{(L-\xi)^{3/2}} e^{-m_{\varphi}L}$$

Summary

Spatially extended operators

- introduce new IR scales
- potentially modify finite volume effects

Toy model matrix elements

- light particle external states
- heavy particle external states

Looking forward

• chiral perturbation theory

$\delta \mathcal{M}_L(oldsymbol{\xi}, oldsymbol{0}) \propto rac{\epsilon}{(}$	$\frac{1}{L-\xi} - \frac{m_{\varphi}(L-\xi)}{L-\xi}$
$\delta \mathcal{M}_L(oldsymbol{\xi},oldsymbol{0}) \propto rac{\delta \mathcal{M}_L(oldsymbol{\xi},oldsymbol{0})}{(L+oldsymbol{\xi})^2}$	$\frac{\xi^{1/2}}{-\xi^{3/2}}e^{-m_{\varphi}L}$

Thank you

cjm373@uw.edu

More generally

$$\mathcal{M}_{\infty}^{(d)}(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{p}) = \int_{q_E} e^{i\mathbf{q}\cdot\boldsymbol{\xi}} \int_{k_{1,E}} \cdots \int_{k_{n-1,E}} D_E^{(d)}(p_E, q_E, k_{1,E}, \cdots, k_{n,E})$$

$$\delta \mathcal{M}_L^{(d)}(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{p}) \equiv \mathcal{M}_L^{(d)}(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{p}) - \mathcal{M}_{\infty}^{(d)}(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{p})$$

$$= \sum_{\mathbf{M} \in \mathbb{Z}^{3n/\{\mathbf{0}\}}} \int_{K_E} e^{i\mathbf{q}\cdot\boldsymbol{\xi} + i\mathbf{K}\cdot L\mathbf{M}} D_E^{(d)}(p_E, K_E)$$

$$K_E \equiv \{q_E, k_{1,E}, \cdots, k_{n-1,E}\} \qquad \mathbf{M} = \{\mathbf{n}, \mathbf{m}_1, \cdots, \mathbf{m}_{n-1}\}$$

R. Briceno, M Hansen & CJM, PRD 96 (2017) 014502

Leading order

Finite volume scaling

$$\delta \mathcal{M}_{L}(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{p}) = \frac{m_{\varphi} g_{\varphi}^{2}}{4\pi^{2}} \sum_{\mathbf{n} \in \mathbb{Z}^{3}/\{\mathbf{0}\}} e^{-i\mathbf{p} \cdot (\boldsymbol{\xi} + L\mathbf{n})} \frac{K_{1} \left(m_{\varphi} | \boldsymbol{\xi} + L\mathbf{n}|\right)}{|\boldsymbol{\xi} + L\mathbf{n}|} \sim \frac{m_{\varphi} g_{\varphi}^{2}}{4\pi^{2}} \frac{K_{1} \left(m_{\varphi} | L - \boldsymbol{\xi}|\right)}{|L - \boldsymbol{\xi}|}$$
$$\delta \mathcal{M}_{L}(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{0}) \propto \frac{e^{-m_{\varphi} (L - \boldsymbol{\xi})}}{(L - \boldsymbol{\xi})^{3/2}}$$



Dominant diagram

$$\delta \mathcal{M}_{L}^{(a)}(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{p}) = g^{2} g_{\varphi}^{2} \sum_{\{\mathbf{n}, \mathbf{m}\} \neq \mathbf{0}} \int_{q_{E}, k_{E}} e^{i\mathbf{q} \cdot (\boldsymbol{\xi} + L\mathbf{n})} e^{iL\mathbf{k} \cdot \mathbf{m}} \frac{1}{[k_{E}^{2} + m_{\varphi}^{2}]^{2}} \frac{1}{(k_{E} + q_{E})^{2} + m_{\varphi}^{2}} \frac{1}{(p_{E} - k_{E})^{2} + m_{\chi}^{2}}$$

Shift momentum variables, introduce Feynman parameters

$$\delta \mathcal{M}_{L}^{(a)}(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{p}) = 2g^{2}g_{\varphi}^{2} \int_{0}^{1} \mathrm{d}xx \sum_{\mathbf{n}, \mathbf{m}} e^{i(1-x)\mathbf{p}\cdot[L(\mathbf{m}-\mathbf{n})-\boldsymbol{\xi}]} \int_{q_{E}} \frac{e^{i\mathbf{q}\cdot(\boldsymbol{\xi}+L\mathbf{n})}}{q_{E}^{2}+m_{\varphi}^{2}} \int_{k_{E}} \frac{e^{i\mathbf{k}\cdot[L(\mathbf{m}-\mathbf{n})-\boldsymbol{\xi}]}}{[k_{E}^{2}+M(x)^{2}]^{3}}$$

$$M(x)^{2} \equiv xm_{\varphi}^{2} + (1-x)m_{\chi}^{2} + x(1-x)p_{E}^{2} = xm_{\varphi}^{2} + (1-x)^{2}m_{\chi}^{2}$$

Carry out momentum integrals

$$\delta \mathcal{M}_{L}^{(a)}(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{0}) = 2g^{2}g_{\varphi}^{2}\sum_{\mathbf{n}, \mathbf{m}} \mathcal{I}_{1}\left[|L\mathbf{n} - \boldsymbol{\xi}|; m_{\varphi}\right] \left[\int_{0}^{1} \mathrm{d}xx \,\mathcal{I}_{3}\left[|L\mathbf{m} - \boldsymbol{\xi}|; M(x)\right]\right]$$

Asymptotically

$$\delta \mathcal{M}_{L}^{(a)}(\boldsymbol{\xi}, \mathbf{0}) \sim \frac{g^{2} g_{\varphi}^{2}}{128\pi^{3} m_{\varphi}} \left[\frac{\xi^{1/2}}{(L-\xi)^{3/2}} H_{x,3/2}(\boldsymbol{\xi}) + \frac{(L-\xi)^{1/2}}{\xi^{3/2}} H_{x,3/2}(L-\xi) \right] e^{-m_{\varphi}L}$$
$$H_{f(x),\alpha}(\boldsymbol{\xi}) = \int_{0}^{1} \mathrm{d}x f(x) \, \frac{m_{\varphi}^{\alpha}}{M(x)^{\alpha}} e^{-\xi(M(x)-m_{\varphi})}$$



PDFs

J.-W. Chen et al, 1804.01483

pion: HISQ 2+1+1, a=0.12fm, L=2.9fm, m=310MeV, P = {0.86, 1.32, 1.74} GeV
J.W. Chen et al, 1803.04393

- HISQ 2+1+1, a=0.09fm, L=5.8fm, m=135MeV, P={2.2,2.6,3.0} GeV

C. Alexandrou et al, 1803.02685

- Tw 2, a=0.09fm, L=4.5fm, m=130MeV, P={0.83,1.11,1.38} GeV

H.-W. Lin et al, 1708.05301

- HISQ 2+1+1, a=0.09fm, L=5.8fm, m=135MeV, P={2.2,2.6,3.0} GeV

C. Alexandrou et al, PRD 96 (2017) 014513

- Tw 2+I+I, a=0.082fm, L=2.6fm, m=370MeV, P={0.49,0.98,1.47,1.96,2.45} GeV J.-W. Chen et al, NPB 911 (2016) 246

- HISQ 2+1+1, a=0.12fm, L=2.9fm, m=310MeV, P={0.43,0.86,1.29} GeV

C. Alexandrou et al, PRD 92 (2015) 014502

- Tw 2+I+I, a=0.082fm, L=2.6fm, m=370MeV, P={0.49,0.98,I.47} GeV

H.-W. Lin et al, PRD 91 (2015) 054510

- HISQ 2+1+1, a=0.12fm, L=2.9fm, m=310MeV, P={0.43,0.86,1.29} GeV

PDAs

G.S. Bali et al, EPJC 78 (2018) 217

- pion: Wilson 2, a=0.071fm, L=2.27fm, m=295MeV, P={1.08, 1.53, 1.88} GeV
- L/a=32, mL=3.4, zmax/a=12 (?)
- J.-W. Chen et al, 1712.10025
 - kaon: HISQ 2+1+1, a=0.12fm, L=2.9fm, m=310MeV, P={0.86,1.29,1.72} GeV
 - L/a=24, mL=4.5, zmax/a=14 (?!)
- J.H. Zhang et al, PRD 95 (2017) 094514
 - pion: HISQ 2+1+1, a=0.12fm, L=2.9fm, m=310MeV
 - L/a=24, mL=4.5, zmax/a=

Finite-volume references



- M.F.L. Golterman and K.-C. Leung, *Phys. Rev.* **D56**, 2950 (1997); *ibid* **D58**, 097503 (1998)
- M. Golterman and E. Pallante, Nucl. Phys. Proc. Suppl. 83, 250 (2000).
- C.-J.D. Lin et al., Nucl. Phys. B650, 301 (2003).
- C.-J.D. Lin et al., Phys. Lett. B553, 229 (2003).
- G. Colangelo, S. Dürr and R. Sommer, Nucl. Phys. Proc. Suppl. 119, 254 (2003).
- G. Colangelo and S. Dürr, hep-lat/0311023
- D. Becirevic and G. Villadoro, hep-lat/0311028.
- D. Arndt and C.-J.D. Lin, hep-lat/0403012
- G. Colangelo and C. Haefeli, hep-lat/0403025
- A. Ali Khan et al. [QCDSF Collaboration], Nucl. Phys. Proc. Suppl. 119, 419 (2003).
- A. Ali Khan et al. [QCDSF Collaboration], hep-lat/0309133.
- A. Ali Khan et al. [QCDSF and UKQCD Collaborations], hep-lat/0312029
- A.A. Khan *et al.*, hep-lat/0312030
- A.S. Kronfeld, hep-lat/0205021
- S.R. Beane, hep-lat/0403015

S. Beane & M. Savage, PRD 70 (2004) 074029

$$\begin{split} \delta\mathcal{M}_{L}^{(a)}(\boldsymbol{\xi},\boldsymbol{0}) &= 2g^{2}g_{\varphi}^{2}\sum_{\mathbf{n},\mathbf{m}}\mathcal{I}_{1}\left[|L\mathbf{n}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;m_{\varphi}\right] \left[\int_{0}^{1}\mathrm{d}xx\,\mathcal{I}_{3}\left[|L\mathbf{m}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;M(x)\right]\right] \\ \delta\mathcal{M}_{L}^{(b)}(\boldsymbol{\xi},\boldsymbol{0}) &= g^{2}g_{\varphi}g_{\chi}\sum_{\{\mathbf{n},\mathbf{m}\}\neq\boldsymbol{0}}\left[\int_{0}^{1}\mathrm{d}x\,\mathcal{I}_{2}\left[|L\mathbf{n}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;M(x)\right]\right] \left[\int_{0}^{1}\mathrm{d}y\,\mathcal{I}_{2}\left[|L\mathbf{m}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;M(y)\right]\right], \\ \delta\mathcal{M}_{L}^{(c)}(\boldsymbol{\xi},\boldsymbol{0}) &= 2g^{2}g_{\chi}^{2}\sum_{\{\mathbf{n},\mathbf{m}\}\neq\boldsymbol{0}}\mathcal{I}_{1}\left[|L\mathbf{n}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;m_{\chi}\right] \left[\int_{0}^{1}\mathrm{d}x\,(1-x)\,\mathcal{I}_{3}\left[|L\mathbf{m}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;M(x)\right]\right], \\ \delta\mathcal{M}_{L}^{(c)}(\boldsymbol{\xi},\boldsymbol{0}) &= g_{\chi\varphi}^{2}\sum_{\{\mathbf{n},\mathbf{m}\}\neq\boldsymbol{0}}\mathcal{I}_{1}\left[|L\mathbf{n}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;m_{\chi}\right]\mathcal{I}_{1}\left[|L\mathbf{m}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;m_{\varphi}\right], \\ \delta\mathcal{M}_{L}^{(e)}(\boldsymbol{\xi},\boldsymbol{0}) &= gg_{\varphi}g_{\chi\varphi}\sum_{\{\mathbf{n},\mathbf{m}\}\neq\boldsymbol{0}}\mathcal{I}_{1}\left[|L\mathbf{n}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;m_{\chi}\right] \left[\int_{0}^{1}\mathrm{d}x\,\mathcal{I}_{2}\left[|L\mathbf{m}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;M(x)\right]\right], \\ \delta\mathcal{M}_{L}^{(e)}(\boldsymbol{\xi},\boldsymbol{0}) &= gg_{\chi}g_{\chi\varphi}\sum_{\{\mathbf{n},\mathbf{m}\}\neq\boldsymbol{0}}\mathcal{I}_{1}\left[|L\mathbf{n}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;m_{\chi}\right] \left[\int_{0}^{1}\mathrm{d}x\,\mathcal{I}_{2}\left[|L\mathbf{m}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;M(x)\right]\right], \\ \delta\mathcal{M}_{L}^{(e)}(\boldsymbol{\xi},\boldsymbol{0}) &= gg_{\chi}g_{\chi\varphi}\sum_{\{\mathbf{n},\mathbf{m}\}\neq\boldsymbol{0}}\mathcal{I}_{1}\left[|L\mathbf{n}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;m_{\chi}\right] \left[\int_{0}^{1}\mathrm{d}x\,\mathcal{I}_{2}\left[|L\mathbf{m}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;M(x)\right]\right], \\ \delta\mathcal{M}_{L}^{(e)}(\boldsymbol{\xi},\boldsymbol{0}) &= gg_{\chi}g_{\chi\varphi}\sum_{\{\mathbf{n},\mathbf{m}\}\neq\boldsymbol{0}}\mathcal{I}_{1}\left[|L\mathbf{n}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;m_{\chi}\right] \left[\int_{0}^{1}\mathrm{d}x\,\mathcal{I}_{2}\left[|L\mathbf{m}|\boldsymbol{\xi}|\right], \\ \delta\mathcal{M}_{L}^{(e)}(\boldsymbol{\xi},\boldsymbol{0}) &= gg_{\chi\varphi}g_{\chi}\sum_{\{\mathbf{n},\mathbf{m}\}\neq\boldsymbol{0}}\mathcal{I}_{1}\left[|L\mathbf{n}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;m_{\chi}\right] \left[\int_{0}^{1}\mathrm{d}x\,\mathcal{I}_{2}\left[|L\mathbf{m}|\boldsymbol{\xi}|\right], \\ \mathcal{M}_{L}^{(e)}(\boldsymbol{\xi},\boldsymbol{0}) &= gg_{\chi\varphi}g_{\chi\varphi}\sum_{\{\mathbf{n},\mathbf{m}\}\neq\boldsymbol{0}}\mathcal{I}_{1}\left[|L\mathbf{n}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;m_{\chi}\right] \left[\int_{0}^{1}\mathrm{d}x\,\mathcal{I}_{2}\left[|L\mathbf{m}|\boldsymbol{\xi}|\right], \\ \mathcal{M}_{L}^{(e)}(\boldsymbol{\xi},\boldsymbol{0}) &= \frac{1}{2}g_{\chi}g_{\chi\varphi\varphi}\sum_{\{\mathbf{n},\mathbf{m}\}\neq\boldsymbol{0}}\mathcal{I}_{1}\left[|L\mathbf{n}-\boldsymbol{\xi}|;m_{\chi}\right]\mathcal{I}_{1}\left[|L\mathbf{m}|;m_{\varphi}\right]. \\ \mathcal{I}_{\gamma}\left[|\boldsymbol{\xi}|;m\right] &= \int_{k_{E}}\frac{e^{i\mathbf{k}\boldsymbol{\xi}}{[k_{E}^{2}+m^{2}]^{\gamma}} = \frac{1}{8\pi^{2}\Gamma(\gamma)}\left(\frac{|\boldsymbol{\xi}|}{2m}\right)^{\gamma-2}K_{\gamma-2}(|\boldsymbol{\xi}|m) \\ \mathcal{M}(x)^{2} &\equiv xm_{\varphi}^{2} + (1-x)m_{\chi}^{2} + x(1-x)p_{E}^{2} = xm_{\varphi}^{2} + (1-x)^{2}m_{\chi}^{2} \right].$$